

Official reviewer's report
on the Doctoral Thesis of Tuleshova Ulzhan Zhangeldynovna «The
Kazakh nobility on service of the Russian Empire in the XIX century:
formation and activity», for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in
specialty 6D020300- «History»

The relevance of the theme.

Tuleshova Ulzhan's dissertation work is devoted to the topical issue of Kazakh historiography – the formation and functioning of the Kazakh nobility. The theme is especially topical during the creation of the state narrative of Kazakhstani history and the reform of the teaching of domestic history in universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The issue is partially reflected in the imperial, Soviet and modern Western, Russian, and in Kazakhstan's historiographies. However, most of the proposed concepts to one degree or another reflect their current political realities, and only in recent years in Kazakhstan have individual scholars turned to an analysis of the policy of the Russian Empire in the Kazakh steppe in order to revise traditional attitudes that do not allow us to assess the true role and place of the Russian Empire in the development of the Kazakh people.

The relevance of the inquiry is appropriate to the latest trends in historical science, which are characterized by a growing interest in the study of social history, applying its methods and tools to the study of the Kazakh nobility.

The thesis of Tuleshova Ulzhan called «Kazakh nobility on service of the Russian Empire in the XIXth century: formation and activity» should be attributed to the unexplored field in the historical science of Kazakhstan, as evidenced by the detailed analysis of historiography presented by the researcher in her work. Existing published studies on this issue only provide an analysis of certain aspects of the problem. This dissertation is the first that gives a holistic view of the process of forming such a social group as the Kazakh nobility as part of the Russian Empire in the XIXth century.

If earlier researchers were more often engaged in social, economic, political, demographic and cultural history, nowadays a person and his reaction to the influence of various factors of the historical process are in the focus. The relevance of the dissertation is also determined by the interdisciplinarity of the study, which can be traced, first of all, through attempts to anthropologize it, the appeal of interest to the individual, who is the main element of the social organism. In this dissertation research, the history of Kazakhstan is significantly enriched by related disciplines – the history of Russia, social history, the history of everyday life, social and cultural anthropology, etc.

The relevance of the dissertation research determined by the contemporary approach to the study of this issue in the framework of the concept of the new imperial history. Analyzing the formation of the institution of the nobility and the features of its functioning among the Kazakh elite, we can trace active transformation of the traditional Kazakh society, which has embarked on the path of modernization, although often not of its own free will. It is from the XIXth

century the historical process of transition from the Kazakh traditional society to the modern type of society begins.

Large number of archival documents, their active implementation into the scientific space of Kazakhstan also actualizes this study.

A great strength of Tuleshova's approach is that she balances expert knowledge of the social and cultural context of the Kazakh nobility in the mid-nineteenth century, with attention to the legal and political projects of the Tsarist state. Tuleshova's research shows a dynamic, far-from-monolithic Kazakh society interacting with the Russian state. In particular, she describes the Steppe social structure both in terms of *soslovie* and Chingissid lineage. Her repeated attention to the *töres*, specifically, ensures that the Kazakh noblemen are not true noblemen of the Russian Empire. The Kazakh population featured competing interests and groups, some of which sought to use imperial institutions and laws to their advantage.

2. Scientific results and their validity

The conclusions formulated by the author of the dissertation are valid, proven and original.

The historiographic review presented in the work demonstrates the author's familiarity with the historiographical tradition of the issue, as well as with the latest trends in the study of administrative policy of the Russian Empire in the Kazakh steppe, New Imperial History, the nobility, works about Kazakh officials, etc.

The research methods declared by the author testify to her acquaintance with the classical and modern historical methodology, which is implemented in the dissertation and allows to achieve the goals.

The research methodology is based on a systematic and historical-comparative approaches, the researcher also uses a historical-structural analysis of historical sources and an integrative approach. The use of macro-level theory, which is the theory of modernization with its heuristic possibilities, allowed to give answers to many questions of social mobility, and also made it possible to more deeply analyze the functioning of the institution of the nobility among Kazakhs of the XIXth century.

Result 1. The study of transformational processes in the territory of the Steppe throughout the XIXth century represents new research as the entry of Kazakh nomads into the structure of the Russian nobility and the honored citizens that had not been an object of special research in the world and Kazakhstan's historical science. At the appropriate scientific level, the author uses various approaches and methods of substantiating the results, conclusions, and recommendations, studying and critically analyzing the known achievements and theoretical positions of other authors on the study of the estate order of the Russian Empire and its multinational character.

Result 2. Tuleshova's source base is comprehensive and appropriate for a study of the nineteenth-century Kazakh steppe and the Russian empire. She relies

on legal acts, circulars, noble genealogical books and other official publications of the Russian state, and works of the Kazakh oral literature.

Result 3. The researcher extending demonstrates the process of the incorporation of Kazakhs into the estate system of the Russian empire in the case of the Kazakh nobility. She argues that representatives of the Kazakh elite were awarded the title «nobleman», «honored citizens» as equals with the settled people even though nomadic Kazakh society represented another political and life structure in comparison with the European lifestyle.

Result 4. The author, in her inquiry, analyses the content, characteristics, and estate privileges of the Kazakh nobility and presents the important argument that the Kazakh nobility mainly presented by sultans who adapted to new imperial orders. It is possible to note that in this process observed symbiosis of elite characteristics of the Kazakh sultans and imperial nobility.

Result 5. The author makes comparatives between noble estates of the nomads of the empire that allows defining character and place of the Kazakh nobility within the empire. Comparative analyses of the methods of the government to different nomadic nobilities reveal the diversity of imperial policy to regions.

Result 6. The most important author's result about using Kazakh nobles the estates' rights and privileges. She argues that representatives of the Kazakh nobility had no rights of the noble estate because of the nomadic way of life, and they didn't need to use estate privileges of the nobility. The Kazakh noblemen did not land, and serfs in the property did not participate in the corporate organizations of the local government of noblemen and had no attributes of the nobility of the empire.

Result 7. Particular interest is the statements revealed by the dissertation about the perception of the nobility and the use of its privileges by nomadic Kazakhs, which consisted of preserving their lifestyle through noble rights. The nomadic way of life, different attitudes towards the status of the nobility of the Kazakhs and central authority, certain goals of the imperial power concerning the Kazakh steppe have become defining signs of the uniqueness of the Kazakh nobility, which in turn reveals the features of the nomadic nobility of the empire. In my opinion, it is the most important result of the dissertation research.

Result 8. The advantage of the dissertation is also that, based on the methods of historical biography, the author carries out her research through the sociocultural dimension of the biographies of Kazakh noble dynasties, which realized themselves in the space of the Russian Empire during the XIXth century, both in local administration and military service in other regions of the empire. The undoubted merit of the presented work is that the author, using a detailed elaboration of the facts of the biographies of Kazakh nobles, managed to present them not only as intermediaries of the empire but also as bright personalities, combining imperial loyalty and national patriotism.

3. Degree of validity and validity of each scientific result (scientific position), and conclusions of the applicant, which formulated in the thesis

Scientific results of the performed research work possess a high degree of reliability that provided with a depth of research of the main concepts of domestic and foreign scientists concerning the studied problem: creative use of various tools, ways and methods of scientific research, application of various methods according to the analysis of primary sources. It is possible to claim that the author rather correctly applies the listed methods of justification of results. For confirmation of the received conclusions in work, the author used statistical materials, archival documents, Kazakh folklore works of the XIXth century, periodicals of the pre-revolutionary time.

Result 1. The reliability of the result is confirmed by archival and published documents extracted from the funds of the five central archives of the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan

Result 2. The source base of the study is extremely diverse and includes legislative materials, statistic dates, recording workflow, oral and written literature, biographical and genealogical resources, etc. Despite the fact that Tuleshova Ulzhan Zhangeldynovna attracts the authentic documents of the Russian and Kazakh archives, she actively uses the published documents, which also characterizes the author as a scholar who ranks documents not by the degree of their novelty, but by their significance for the study.

Result 3. This result is justified by specific biographical data of representatives of the Kazakh nobility, extracted from archival materials.

Result 4. Obviously, the nobility was “poisoned” by innovations brought by the Russian Empire much faster than the people, although it might not have accepted them. Often, the elite influenced the formation of protest moods and led the national liberation movements in the region. As a result of such a manifestation of disobedience to the authorities, the Russian administration refused to rely only on the traditional nobility and literally paved the way for a career for all soliciting authority under the auspices of the empire. The adoption of the Statutes of 1822 and 1824 only accelerated this process. The main thing now was not the origin, but the loyalty and service to the empire

Result 5. The veracity of the result is justified by comparing the status of the nobility among the Tatars, Bashkirs, Kalmyks and Kazakhs.

Result 6. The doctoral candidate relies on data from various sources, substantiating the specifics of the formation of a new class group among Kazakhs, as well as the specifics of the perception of this group by traditional Kazakh society.

Result 7. The entire Kazakh elite could conditionally be divided into two groups: those who were in the service of the Russian government and those who were not. Both groups were a very heterogeneous phenomenon. The first group took legitimacy from the Russian throne, the other one was elected on the basis of the steppe suffrage and, often, they were acknowledged as legitimate by China or the Central Asian khanates, out of accord with Russia. We can also talk about the existence of a double legitimacy of the Kazakh nobility, when its representatives received support from both the people and the imperial authorities.

Result 8. Through the use of the method of historical biography, the researcher collected a number of unique data on the representatives of the Kazakh elite.

4. Degree of the novelty of each scientific result (position), the output of the applicant formulated in the thesis

Result 1. The novelty of the result is determined by the fact that the doctoral research scholar introduces into the scientific circulation new archival materials extracted from the five state archives of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation

Result 2. The author succeeded to uncover the problem of etymology and highlight the criteria for the concept of "nobility" in modern research, analyze the principles of the formation of the institution of the nobility, determine the features of its functioning among the Kazakhs of the XIXth century. The researcher defines the mechanism of incorporation of the Kazakh elite into the hereditary and titled nobility of the Empire and the nature of the interaction of the center and local officials within this policy.

Result 3. The researcher compiles lists of Kazakh noble families of the Empire and defines the coat of arms of the noble families, and reveals social adaptation of traditional nomadic society and distinctive signs of the Kazakh nobility in this society.

Result 4. The author defines features of the estate rights of Kazakh nomads, nobles of the Russian Empire, in the context of imperial governance, and a new social structure in the Steppe.

Result 5. The author reveals the result of the social policy of the government in the Steppe: whether it ruled to the Kazakh nomadic society to become a part of an imperial estate system.

Result 6. The researcher analyzes the process of perception by the Kazakh population of social transformation through the oral literature of Kazakhs of the XIXth century.

Result 7. The author presents the list of noblemen of Kazakhs and studies their activity in the political, cultural life of the Kazakh society in the XIXth century.

Result 8. A number of names and details of biographies of representatives of the Kazakh elite, who were previously unknown or unfairly forgotten, have been introduced into the scientific intellectual space

5. The practical and theoretical significance of scientific results

In our opinion, the practical value and scientific significance of the results of this dissertation is very high. The topic of the dissertation is of great interest and speaks of significant changes in the perspective of studying the historical past. The doctoral research scholar demonstrates the desire for "anthropologization" of scientific research. In the center of the study is a person, his fate, his career, the opportunities for the social vertical, which indicates significant modernization

transformations in the region. Thanks to archival research, the “living fabric of history” is restored, forgotten or lost names are returned.

The theoretical significance of the inquiry is that the results of the thesis of Ulzhan Tuleshova present a new approach in researching Kazakh social history and expands the representation of the estate structure of the Russian empire. In addition, the results and conclusions of the study have a large theoretical and practical significance and can be used to solve disputable problems of the concept of «new imperial history».

The significance of the scientific results of this dissertation is quite high, since not only a fundamentally new volume of archival materials was put into scientific circulation, but most importantly, they were analyzed based on the latest theoretical and methodological approaches presented in the works of such authors as J. Burbank, F. Cooper, A. Kappeler, R.G. Suny, S. Becker, V.A. Kivelson, D. Lieven, M. Confino, etc.

The results of the work presented in the author's 15 publications, including journals recommended by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of Kazakhstan, in the international scientific publication, indexed in database of Scopus and Web of Science.

6. Remarks, suggestions on the thesis

Along with the indisputable advantages of the dissertation research by Tuleshova Ulzhan, it's necessary to pay attention to certain omissions:

1. The theoretical contexts of the modernization paradigm are actively used in the dissertation, however, in the introduction to the methodological part there is no mention of the advantages of its use in studying the formation and activities of the Kazakh nobility of the XIXth century.

2. Unfortunately, the doctoral research scholar has lost sight of a number of recent works published by Russian and Kazakh historians. In the dissertation, enough attention is paid to the analysis of the imperial system of managing the region, which in many respects predetermined social transformations in the Kazakh society, but there are no references to the monographs of the Russian scholar, Doctor of Sciences D. Vassilyev («Russia and the Kazakh steppe: administrative policy and the status of the outskirts. XVIII – the first half of the XIX century (M. 2014. 471 p.); «Outpost of the empire. Administrative policy of Russia in Central Asia. Mid XIX century» (M., 2015. 303 p.); «The burden of the empire: the administrative policy of Russia in Central Asia: the second half of the XIXth century» (M. 2018. 636 p.). Monograph of the Kazakh scholar Izbasarova G.B. called «Kazakh steppe of the Orenburg department in imperial projects and practices of the first half of XIX century» (M., 2018, 484 p.) and her other articles also raise issues of the formation of the Kazakh elite and its activity. In addition, the works of S.K. Uderbaeva would be very useful for understanding the degree of knowledge of Kazakh officialdom.

3. As a wish to the author of the thesis, I would like to say the following: It will be interesting to trace the fate of the heirs of Kazakh nobles in the following period. The question of the participation of descendants of the noble dynasties in the political and social life of Kazakhs in the early XXth century needs further elaboration.

7. Correspondence of thesis content within the requirements of the Rules of awarding degrees

The results of the thesis are an original, scientific novelty and practical significance, demonstrating the author's contribution to national and world-historical science. It characterizes the applicant as a well-established researcher who knows how to set and solve the complex tasks of historical science independently. With its attention to detail, nuanced argumentation, and exhaustive source base, this dissertation more than fulfills Tuleshova's stated objective of advancing the study of Kazakh history.

Summing up the general result, it is necessary to conclude that the new scientific results obtained by the dissertation are essential for Kazakhstan's historical science and practice in the field of history, and the dissertation itself is a completed scientific and qualification work; that meets the passport 6D020300 – «History».

The dissertation «The Kazakh nobility on service of the Russian Empire in the XIXth century: formation and activity» meets the requirements of the Higher Attestation Commission for dissertations for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author, Tuleshova Ulzhan Zhangel'dynovna, deserves the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) 6D020300 – «History».

Official reviewer
Doctor of Historical Sciences,
Department History of Kazakhstan,
Professor
L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University

20.11.2019

Kovalskaya S.I.

